DEPARTMENT OF MUSIC PERFORMANCE STUDIES
PROGRAM REVIEW

REVIEW PROCESS

The Department of Music Performance Studies prepared a self-study following program review guidelines. A two-person external review team visited the campus; reviewed the self-study documents; interviewed unit personnel, university administrators, undergraduate and graduate students; and submitted an external review report. The Program Review Committee (PRC) studied all written materials. The PRC liaison for the Department discussed the self-study materials with the department chair and faculty. The PRC discussed the Department with the Dean of the College of Musical Arts. This document summarizes the self-study and the external reviewers’ report, and adds the PRC’s findings and recommendations.

SUMMARY OF THE SELF-STUDY

Mission

The Department seeks to provide the potential professional performer and/or teacher with the finest instrument/vocal training within the context of a comprehensive curriculum. This is accomplished through individual study, participation in ensembles, solo performance, and specialized course work. To fulfill the College of Music Arts' aspiration to be the premier music learning community in the state and one of the best in the nation, the Department is committed to recruiting a diverse and talented study body; continuing to be the first choice of Ohio students who aspire to a career in music; recruiting and retaining accomplished performers, teachers, and administrators; fostering a learning community based on shared governance, collegiality, and commitment to the University's core values; contributing to the cultural life of the University, local community, state, and region; constructing new knowledge and preserving our world musical cultural heritage, while providing leadership in the creation and performance of contemporary music; and monitoring and assessing the effectiveness of the Department's efforts.

The Department supports all music degrees in the College, and it enriches the University and community through faculty recitals, student concerts, various campus bands, and numerous ensembles. Its faculty are involved in outreach programs throughout Northwest Ohio.

Recent History

The Department was created in the early 1970s when the School of Music was established, which in 1977 became the College of Musical Arts. Initiatives in recent years include expanded
outreach activities, including Music from Bowling Green at the Manor House; WGTE-FM re-broadcasts of the Faculty Artist Series; Young People's Concerts; and touring of instrumental, choral, and opera groups. A compact disc project is still being developed as a recruitment tool.

Administrative changes include the adoption of computerized student evaluations, the development of a student applied music base, the establishment of definitive deadlines for merit reports and of regular office hours for chairs to meet with faculty and students, and adoption of measures to assure a more objective faculty recruitment process.

Budgetary changes include adoption of a formal application process for faculty conferences and trips, reduction of class sizes in basic conducting classes, utilization of more part-time faculty to meet student needs in certain areas, and securing private funding for several graduate assistantships.

Faculty changes include development of a document on teaching loads and requirements for course syllabi.

Curricular changes include the Master of Music in Performance specialization in jazz studies and collaborative piano.

**Description of Unit**

*Program Identification.* The Department offers degree programs at the undergraduate and graduate levels and a non-degree Music Certificate Program. The Department includes 32 full-time and 17 part-time faculty, supported administratively by a chair, an assistant chair, and one classified secretarial position. The performance faculty is organized into six areas: woodwind, brass/percussion, strings, keyboard, voice, and jazz. The chair is responsible for a wide range of matters in areas of curriculum, personnel, budget management, governance, and enrollment management.

*Faculty Staff, and Student Resources.* The Faculty Work Loads Policy (18-hour model) of 1999 established credit hours for applied studies, academic music courses, ensembles, and coordinators. Appendices to the report detail staffing, graduate assistant, and student credit hour data.

*Recruitment and Retention.* The College Coordinator of Admissions coordinates recruitment at the undergraduate level; this effort requires substantial faculty participation. The recruitment plan covers a wide range of activities throughout the academic year, including six audition days. Retention is addressed through a mid-semester warning system for students. The Graduate Program recruitment includes the six official audition days, extensive mailings and advertisements, and a website. Retention is addressed through mid-year and end-of-year assessments of graduate assistants.

*Instructional Service to Other Areas.* The Department serves all students in the College as well as students from across campus who participate in the ensemble programs. In addition,
the Department provides applied instruction for students in the musical theatre program as well as for students who pass an audition.

Facilities and Equipment. The Moore Musical Arts Center provides extensive facilities, including two performance halls, two large rehearsal rooms, 16 classrooms, 52 faculty studios/offices, and 88 practice rooms.

Information Resources and Services. The Public Events Office assists faculty performers with concert, recital, and presentation production through scheduling, advertising, and other aspects of promotion and support.

Financial Resources. The Department administers scholarships of the College with the objectives of attracting outstanding students, recognizing musical leadership, supporting instrumental and programmatic diversity within the College, and encouraging music student to complete their degrees at the University. The Department administers graduate assistantships funded by the Graduate College to recruit outstanding students and to augment teaching demands. The Department also administers various scholarships for undergraduate and graduate students funded by external sources. Ticketed events of ensembles generate additional funds.

Self-Evaluation

Faculty Quality. The performance faculty display their abilities regularly on campus, statewide, regionally, nationally, and internationally. There are no comparative statistics, but non-traditional comparisons indicated that a number of the faculty are performing at a high level in professional conventions, adjudication, and performances at the international level.

The Promotion and Tenure Document of the Department addresses the wide-based specialties and opportunities for individual faculty. As the focus of creative activity, the art of live performance required comprehensiveness, including repertoire, pedagogy, practice, and collaborative performance.

Student Quality. The College ranks in the top 10% by size of 500 music schools in the country; most of the other schools in this category have doctoral programs.

Quality of Curriculum, Instruction, & Support Services. The Department bases instruction on the studio-conservatory model, which, while expensive, is essential for excellence in performance. A major challenge is to balance the numbers of students within each studio, which is essential to assuring reasonable teaching loads and instrumentation balance. Enrollment management is needed to assure a reasonable balance. Due to the unique nature of instruction, the Department has been able to maintain a roster of quality artist teachers who develop the skills of all students within the College in addition to those obtaining performance degrees. It is a service department to students who major in other areas of the College. The large number of voice students has required the hiring of adjunct faculty in that area, but there remains a need for a vocal coach and staff accompanists. The Department receives exceptional support from the Public Events Office.
Graduate Program. The self-study included the records of four typical graduate students in different performance areas. The Department focuses on four areas in assessing student learning outcomes: competence, independence, communication, and creativity. Assessment is carried out at several stages. An entrance audition is required of every student desiring to take private music lessons or to pursue a music degree. Students must audition for performance ensembles. Every student taking private lessons must present a "jury" performance at the end of the semester, which is the primary means of assessing performance. The faculty continues to evaluate assessment activities.

In 2001-02, the brass area made significant changes in its assessment practices, including greater stress on competence and independence; they experimented with different assessment activities, which led to significant progress in the horn and trumpet studios. In 2002, the jazz area also modified its assessment, particularly by attention to collating jury data, updating data on individual students, and individual conferences with jazz students.

Comparative Advantage/Uniqueness. The Department attracts well-prepared, academically proficient students. The interdependence of the departments in the College of Musical Arts is crucial to the College's mission. The comprehensiveness of the performance programs sets this Department apart from most other music programs in the state and region.

Financial Considerations. The self-study notes that the instructional program is as cost effective as possible, but the Department has needs in staffing, equipment, and scholarship.

Unit Planning

Goals and Strategies. The Department anticipates that within the next year, the period of substantial recruitment of faculty will end, enabling a return to the stability that had long characterized the Department. To meet the needs of faculty, the Department must have increased secretarial support; one secretary is inadequate for a department the size of Performance Studies. A vocal coach and staff accompanists are the other compelling staffing needs. The Department is attending to the problem of enrollment management with the objective of achieving an even population of ensembles. To attract quality graduate students, the Department is dealing with a decrease of graduate assistant funding from the Graduate College by seeking increased external support. It also must address the problems of undergraduate students receiving more attractive scholarship offers from other institutions. The Department is also planning greater coordination among its ensembles, and is undertaking efforts to increase the size of audiences for performances in the region. The Department believes that its lack of involvement in the general education program should be re-examined. The increased number of students in the Department means that the facilities designed for significantly fewer students when the facility was built in 1979 are no longer adequate. Computer support for faculty has improved significantly in recent years, but upgrading computers and providing digital video equipment are necessary. With respect to future curricular development, the Department believes that the new degree in musical theatre will attract increased numbers of students (and present additional staffing problems) and that the proposed doctoral program is appropriate given the Department's leading position among NASM-accredited music schools, the quality of the faculty, its capacity to enhance the instructional program, and its attractiveness to students.
Timetable and Implementation Plan. The Department sets forth a plan for addressing its needs from 2002-03 to 2006-07. Emphasized the first two years are instructional staff stability, enrollment management, ensemble requirements, department leadership, studio instruction evaluation, review of promotion and tenure document, and general studies courses.

RESULTS OF PREVIOUS REVIEWS

This is the first cycle of academic program review for the Department of Music Performance Studies.

SUMMARY OF THE EXTERNAL REPORT

The external evaluators noted two underlying problems in the self-study report. First, given the interrelationships among the three departments in the College, the lack of information about the two other departments made it difficult to assess the past data and future plans of the Department of Music Performance Studies. Second, the Department's stated goals fail to include the means of attaining them (except for the proposed doctoral program) and failed to address how the goals could be accomplished with current resources.

The external report addressed a number of specific aspects of the self-study and, in the process, made a number of recommendations.

External Reviewers Comments and Recommendations

1. Faculty Quality. While it appears that the faculty are engaged in the kind of productivity and creative achievement expected of professional music schools, the brief biographies make it difficult to assess reputations. Partly as a consequence of the recent loss of productive senior faculty, it may take a few years before the over-all stature of the faculty will improve beyond the present estimates of 10-15% with national/international reputations and most others with state/regional reputations. The Department has had an unusual level of faculty turnover in recent years and it is imperative outstanding senior performance faculty be replaced at the highest professional level. Recent appointments appear to be uneven.

2. Staffing. The need for an additional secretarial position was compelling to the external reviewers, given the decentralized nature of the College and the demands placed on the Department office. The lack of staff accompanists is a concern that ought to be a Department priority. This is a common problem in music schools, who are addressing it either by hiring local collaborative, professional-quality pianists on a part-time basis or by creating full-time or part-time staff positions. The Department ought to give priority also to the position of vocal coach, which is essential to a quality opera program and to the needs of vocal students.

3. Enrollment Management and Recruitment. This issue has not been addressed in previous years, but it is essential. At the minimum, this requires that the administration, ensemble directors, and studio faculty establish the number of instruments/voices needed for each program. In addition, the recruiting/audition process should be reviewed to make certain
that only the finest students are being admitted. In order to enhance over-all student quality, the brass, woodwinds, and percussion faculty should adopt the practice of the strings, voice, and keyboard faculty in holding joint auditions. Moreover, ensemble directors should be included in the auditions. These measures should help address the unevenness evident in juries and in the orchestra concert attended by the reviewers.

Also, in the face of increasing tuition, the Department needs to make certain that the level of scholarship support is sufficient to recruit the most talented students. The request for additional space must be integrated with the enrollment management issue and the new theatre building; in fact facilities for music should be adequate for the near future.

4. Graduate Assistantships. The Department is to be congratulated for efforts to establish additional assistantship through grants and partnership. The number of department assistantships (24 of the 40 in the College) seems appropriate given the size of the department’s graduate program. Stipend levels are not competitive with major music schools and the University should increase the level of support.

5. Ensemble Touring. A two- or three-year plan of ensemble touring, an imperative activity, should be developed, taking into consideration the size of the group, and the instrumental/vocal needs of the College.

6. General Education. The Department has no General Education courses, but like a number of departments of performance, it offers opportunities for non-specialists; it may not be appropriate to categorize these experiences as general education courses. The external reviewers proposed collaboration with the Department of Theatre to establish General Education interdisciplinary courses involving art, music, and theatre.

7. Doctoral Program. The proposal for an interdisciplinary doctor of musical arts degree in contemporary music with a specialization in composition or performance builds on the strengths of the Department and other programs on campus and addresses issues related to the future of the music profession. This proposal is endorsed, and it appears that the University is prepared to support the program through additional assistantships. On the other hand, it does not appear that the University will support additional faculty and it is not clear how current faculty assignments would be adjusted to cover the demands of a doctoral program. The deployment of doctoral students as primary instructors of core courses would be a questionable step given the strong University commitment to undergraduate education.

8. Faculty Load. Recent changes have resulted in reduction of teaching assignments in ways that bring them in line with peer departments, but there is a lack of understanding among College faculty as to what constitutes a full load. Administrative clarification is suggested.

9. Musical Theatre Degree. The new degree in musical theatre, while well-received by both music and theatre faculty, has led to concerns about the number of singers, the teaching of voice students by graduate assistants, and the need for adjunct faculty. Enrollment management with a higher standard of admission should reduce the number of majors and reduce the need for
non-faculty instruction. Singers and pianists noted that the level of instruction in graduate assistant studios is very uneven.

10. Ensemble Requirement. The ensemble requirement for undergraduate majors, despite its importance in the NASM accreditation review, has not been satisfactorily addressed and has been the source of misunderstanding. Besides the need to make certain that students are not dropping out of ensembles, the Department has had difficulty in determining which ensembles are appropriate. It is important that the Chair, Dean, and faculty reach closure on this issue. The ensemble requirement for master’s students also needs to be addressed, as does the standardization of credits granted for ensemble participation.

11. Probationary Faculty. The mentoring of probationary faculty requires a more formal policy so that every probationary faculty is assigned a mentor or mentors.

12. Coordination of Conductors. The practices of housing conductors in two different departments (music education or performance studies) is unique among music colleges and creates problems of coordination and differing standards of evaluation. The College should consider establishing an ensemble area with a coordinator.

13. Department Administration. The leadership of the Department is provided by an efficient and respected chair, but her anticipated retirement in the near future necessitates assigning some senior faculty administrative duties in order to facilitate the transition to a new chair. The role of the Assistant Dean for Graduate Studies is an asset to the effective administration of the College, but the Dean ought to limit her responsibilities so that her progress toward tenure is not jeopardized.

**PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE FINDINGS**

The Department of Performance Studies has a rich history of contributions to the cultural life of the University, region, and beyond. It is to be commended for its ongoing commitment to a wide-range of individual and group performances. That commitment is also noteworthy in the time devoted by faculty to recruiting students, including the auditions, and to evaluating undergraduate and graduate students.

The Department appears to be effectively administered. In recent years it has addressed a number of important issues, including a change in teaching assignment policy and faculty evaluation policy.

The Department plays a vital role in the curriculum of the College of Musical Arts and it appears that the Dean's office and the three departments have a generally effective set of working relationships. However, the PRC needs to complete reviews of the other departments in the College next year, in order to get a complete picture.

The Department's success at fund-raising from private sources is a further testimony to its commitments to enhancing educational opportunities for its students and also an indication of the influence that the unit has had in the region and nation.
Findings Requiring Action

1. Faculty Quality. With the large turnover of faculty in recent years, the Department faces a significant challenge in recruiting and retaining faculty who will maintain the Department's historic high reputation. The PRC shares the external reviewers' concerns over the difficulty of assessing faculty reputations from the information provided in the self-study. There can be no question, however, of the national stature of a number of the faculty. Yet, anytime that a Department goes through a significant turnover, a major objective must be to recruit and retain faculty who promise to achieve national recognition. The PRC notes that the external reviewers considered relatively few faculty to be at the national recognition, underscoring the challenge facing the Department in its rebuilding phase. The PRC notes the external reviewers' observation of "unevenness" in recent faculty additions. "Unevenness" is, of course, inherent in any program; even the most outstanding program may have "unevenness" within a strong faculty; or, it can signify a more serious problem. In the absence of elaboration by the external reviewers, the PRC is inclined to believe that they intended the latter meaning; why else would it have been written into their report? In view of this concern, as well as part of the Department's progress in any event, the PRC concludes that the Department must monitor very closely the progress of its newer faculty and that it adhere to the highest standards in retention and tenure decisions. The anticipated review of the Department's Tenure and Promotion policy should bring this concern to the Department's attention in a timely manner.

2. Student Quality and Assessment. A high quality faculty and high quality students are mutually reinforcing, especially in a program which is dependent upon individual instruction. The problems of unevenness of student performances noted by the external reviewers appears to be related to problems in enrollment management, the ensemble requirement, audition practices, and increased reliance on adjunct faculty and graduate assistants for the instruction of majors. While the PRC believes that generally one finds considerable evidence of a high quality of undergraduate majors and graduate students, it finds that the Department needs to make every effort to assure the maintenance of high standards in admissions and in the fulfillment of requirements. The PRC notes that in this area, the external reviewers found "unevenness" especially in student performances. The PRC is inclined to believe that the external reviewers' concern ought to serve as a reminder that the faculty must be committed to achieving and maintaining standards that will assure a high level of student performance

3. Staffing Needs. The Department's most compelling needs appear to be a secretarial position, a vocal coach, and staff accompanists.

4. Graduate Program. The maintenance of a quality master's program, as the Department self-study acknowledges, requires a major commitment to recruitment, increased levels of funding, and development of performance opportunities that will be attractive to prospective students. The PRC finds that the Department needs to follow through on its plans to maintain a quality master's program by enhanced recruitment efforts and the broadening of performance opportunities. Given the visibility of its program, the Department is in a better position than most departments to gain external funding.
5. Proposed Doctoral Program. An interdisciplinary doctor of musical arts degree is a logical step in the Department's development and has benefits to the Department and University. It fits the University's policy of developing focused doctoral programs. The PRC is impressed by the arguments that this will enhance faculty recruitment and retention, that it will build on existing strengths, and that it will be appealing to a reasonable number of students. There are, however, reasons to question the advisability of the program at least at this time, inasmuch as the Department is going through such a broad transformation of its faculty. Although the Department has "pockets of excellence," it might be advisable to delay moving on this proposal until more of the newer faculty are better established and have the reputations that will attract students. Moreover, like the external reviewers, the PRC is uncertain whether the doctoral program would be at the expense of the undergraduate program. While it would provide more graduate assistants for undergraduate instruction, the PRC questions whether it is in the interest of the Department, College, and University to have more undergraduate instruction being shifted from regular faculty. Perhaps the most impressive characteristic of the Department is a strong record of faculty commitment to undergraduate instruction. This is obviously a major factor in undergraduate recruitment. The PRC finds that the Department must make certain that that tradition be preserved. Finally, with respect to the doctoral proposal itself, the exact role of Performance Studies in the program and whether the Department has assembled appropriate resources to support a research-oriented program are not clear to the PRC.

6. General Education. The Department has no general education courses, but it does correctly see itself as serving the needs of students outside of the College of Musical Arts. The PRC recognizes the difficulties facing the Department in terms of expanding its involvement in general education. The PRC is, however, impressed by the prospective benefits of enhanced collaboration with the Department of Theatre and the School of Art.

7. Ensembles and Conductors. At several points in the external report, attention was called to problems related to the ensemble program. These included concern about whether students were fulfilling the requirement, credits granted for participation, the lack of a clear plan of touring, the inadequate response to the NASM accreditation review, and the coordination of conductors.

8. Planning. Considering the plans for a role in general education and the establishment of a doctoral program, the Department is at a critical point in its history. This requires an assessment of the adequacy of existing and anticipated resources to support these expanded missions without compromising the long-standing commitment to a quality undergraduate program.

Program Review Committee Recommendations

Based on reviews of the self-study and external review documents, and consistent with the major findings that resulted from these reviews, the PRC makes the following recommendations. For detail about the rationale for each recommendation, see the finding with the corresponding number, just above.
1. **Faculty Quality.** In order to ensure a high quality faculty, the PRC recommends that as part of the review of the Tenure and Promotion policy, the Department should establish by May 2004 a plan for the mentoring of untenured faculty. The responsibility for mentoring should be distributed among tenured faculty.

2. **Student Quality and Assessment.** In order to ensure students of high quality, the PRC recommends that the Department's assessment program be directed toward careful measurements of student performance and that the Department use the results of assessment to design curricular or pedagogical changes that will enhance student performance. The Department should continue to submit annual assessment reports.

3. **Staffing Needs.** The PRC recommends that the Department coordinate its secretarial, vocal coach, and accompanist needs within the context of over-all staffing— including faculty—needs. A plan for meeting these needs, with clearly stated priorities and sources of funding, should be presented to the Dean for his consideration by December 2003.

4. **Graduate Program.** To maintain a quality graduate program, the PRC recommends that the Department build on its fundraising efforts by establishing a program of targeted objectives over a three-to-five year period. This should be done in coordination with the College and the Development office, and should look toward endowed faculty positions and graduate student fellowships.

5. **Proposed Doctoral Program.** The PRC recommends that the Department reconsider whether it has the faculty and financial resources to support a quality doctoral program at this time. The PRC believes that it would be better to defer OBOR action than to go forward with a proposal that may lead to a mediocre program.

6. **General Education.** The PRC recommends that the Department make every effort to bring its unique resources and talents to a wider audience of undergraduate students through participation in the general education program.

7. **Ensembles and Conductors.** Since the problems in this area extends beyond the Department, the PRC recommends that the College undertake a comprehensive review of the ensemble program. This needs to address the concerns raised in the external reviewers' report. This process should be integrated with the other departments' program reviews in 2003-04.

8. **Planning.** The PRC recommends that the principal agenda of the Department in 2003-04 should be a full examination of its objectives and resources, in particular whether it can both expand its undergraduate mission through a role in general education and establish a quality doctoral program. A priority, in the PRC's opinion, must be to assure that changes will not be allowed to compromise a well-earned reputation of commitment to excellence in existing programs.

The Department of Performance Studies should report annually to the Dean of the College of Musical Arts, with a copy to the Provost, on the implementation of these recommendations.