BGSU ALLIES: Building Inclusive Leadership Practices and Policies to Transform the Institution

Final Annual Report to NSF – September 1, 2023 - August 31, 2024

Cover

Federal Agency and Organization	4900
Element to Which Report is	
Submitted:	
Award Number:	1760389
Award Title:	BGSU ALLIES: Building Inclusive Leadership Practices and Policies
	to Transform the Institution
PI/Co-PIs:	Margaret Yacobucci
	Lisa Hanasono
	Julia Matuga
	Michael Ogawa
	Sheila Roberts
Recipient Organization:	Bowling Green State University
Project/Grant Period:	09/01/2018 – 08/31/2024
Reporting Period:	09/01/2023 – 08/31/2024

Accomplishments

1. What are the major goals of the project?

BGSU ALLIES is adapting components of the evidence-based ADVANCE-Institutional Transformation projects of North Dakota State University ("Advocates & Allies" program) and Florida International University ("Bystander Leadership" program) into an integrated model to build faculty allies within departments and inclusive leaders across the university. The BGSU ALLIES project focuses on how administrators and faculty allies can work collaboratively to reduce biases and transform institutional policies and practices.

The project goal is to make allyship and inclusive leadership the expectation and norm at BGSU. To achieve this goal, the project is pursuing four key objectives:

- 1) Revise institutional policies and processes to make allyship and inclusive leadership the expectation for faculty and administrators.
- 2) Design training materials, workshops, and online modules to develop departmental allies and inclusive leaders knowledgeable about inclusion and intersectionality and empowered to actively combat bias.

- 3) Deploy new data collection processes allowing better tracking of faculty advancement in the context of intersecting identities (including non-binary gender, race, ethnicity, national origin, sexuality, dis/ability status).
- 4) Disseminate training materials and best practices to other institutions through a strategic communication plan and a regional conference to be held at BGSU in 2021 (postponed to 2022 due to the COVID-19 pandemic).

BGSU ALLIES is working with 16 academic units in STEM and Social & Behavioral Sciences (SBS) across four colleges: Arts & Sciences, Business, Education & Human Development, and Technology, Architecture & Applied Engineering, as well as faculty at our branch campus, Firelands College. These units include approximately 272 full-time faculty and Chairs/Directors.

2. What was accomplished under these goals? You must provide information for at least one of the 4 categories below.

a) Major Activities

We pursued 5 objectives in Year 6:

1) Pilot online training modules

We continued developing online modules designed to help learners recognize and combat biases that result in inequities based on gender, race, and other marginalized identities. The design includes five foundational modules covering core skills useful for both faculty and Chairs/Directors (C/Ds) and two sets of context-specific modules, one targeting specific roles faculty may play and one focusing on the needs of C/Ds. Intersectionality is woven through the modules, with a segment of Module 1 devoted to explaining the concept and later modules illustrating how women faculty with other marginalized identities face unique challenges. These modules are now completed, with one exception (Shaping an Inclusive Departmental Culture), which is drafted but not yet configured online.

In February 2024, participants in BGSU's New Faculty Learning Community were invited to explore the foundational modules and then engaged in discussion about faculty allyship. Several new faculty expressed a desire to be active allies for their colleagues, though their workload and the newness of their university position left them somewhat hesitant. In future, we would like to introduce the modules to new faculty one at a time to allow more time to engage, reflect, and discuss the content, and provide a completion certificate that can be used in their faculty evaluation materials. We also want to offer a BGSU ALLIES Learning Community open to any interested faculty who want to work through the online modules and then meet every few weeks to discuss them.

2) Continue work on research projects on faculty allyship

The ALLIES team has collected longitudinal survey data from faculty and university leaders to test the impact of our Faculty Allies and Inclusive Leadership workshops and broader

programming. The team is preparing manuscripts on two research studies. Guided by the theory of planned behavior, the first study examines how attitudes, domain-specific knowledge, perceived behavioral control, and behavioral intentions influenced the enactment of faculty allyship at the workplace. Focusing on measurement and methods, the second study investigates the veracity of pre-, post- and retrospective pre-test survey data. Results from this study offer practical recommendations for researchers and practitioners who aim to gather accurate data about the efficacy of their faculty development workshops.

We also continued work on a study using a multi-institution approach to explore how institutional policies, practices, and culture shape faculty perceptions and behaviors of allyship. In Year 6, a conceptual paper describing our Faculty Ally Behavior scale was revised, resubmitted, and published in the *ADVANCE Journal*. For the first deployment of the survey, the team has focused on racial allyship for STEM faculty, with plans to substitute gender for race in future versions, and then expand to consider intersecting marginalized identities. During Year 6, members of this team also developed materials for conducting cognitive interviews about the scale, including interview protocols, slides, consent forms, a screening form, recruitment materials, and a plan for pilot testing. These materials were submitted to BGSU's Institutional Review Board (IRB) in July 2024. The interviews will likely take place in 2024-2025, with deployment of the instrument to multiple universities in 2025-2026.

3) Disseminate research results and project accomplishments via conference presentations and publications

In Year 6, the ALLIES team disseminated research results and information on ALLIES activities to a variety of audiences. We ran a brown bag discussion for BGSU faculty on "Understanding and Teaching About Privilege" in September 2023. We were invited to conduct allyship and inclusive leadership workshops at the University of Toledo in December 2023 and the U.S. National Laboratories Information Technology Summit in April 2024 (see Significant Results section for details). A research paper on our Faculty Transformative Ally Behaviors instrument was published in the *ADVANCE Journal*. PI Yacobucci presented a poster describing our project sustainability efforts at the June 2024 Equity in STEM Community Convening. In August 2024, ALLIES team members recorded a podcast produced by Dr. Cheryl Bracken, current Director of BGSU's School of Media and Communication and formerly co-PI of Cleveland State University's ADVANCE grant. In this podcast, we talked about the impact of the ALLIES project on BGSU. We also continued to maintain the BGSU ALLIES website and Facebook page.

4) Collect data for project evaluation

Internal and external evaluators and internal and external advisory boards completed their work prior to Year 6.

BGSU conducted a COACHE survey in Spring 2023 and throughout Year 6 we requested access to those results from the Office of the Provost. Our intention was to compare the 2023 COACHE results to those of COACHE surveys conducted in Spring 2019 (during Year 1 of the ALLIES project) and Spring 2015 (prior to our project), with the goal of assessing

changes in women faculty's satisfaction over this 8-year interval. However, as of August 2024, the Provost has declined to provide access to the COACHE results.

Faculty and Chair/Director demographic data were compiled for Fall 2024 and compared to data from Fall 2018, at the start of the BGSU ALLIES project. See Significant Results section and appended data file for details.

5) Continue work on sustaining BGSU ALLIES

In Year 6, we continued working to sustain our efforts at BGSU and beyond. We collaborated with BGSU's Division of Inclusion and Belonging, led by Chief Inclusion Officer (CIO) K. Stygles, throughout Year 6 to institutionalize BGSU ALLIES programming and policy recommendations. We established a Faculty Associates program within the Division. Faculty Associates will partner with Division staff to design and facilitate relevant programs for faculty and staff, using many of the ALLIES-produced resources and workshop materials. For a commitment of 2-5 hours/week, each Faculty Associate will receive a \$2,500/semester stipend, funded through the President's Office. In Fall 2023, we drafted a position description and solicited faculty applicants. Members of the ALLIES team worked with the Chief and Deputy CIOs to review applications and selected two inaugural Faculty Associates. One Faculty Associate has already served as a BGSU ALLIES Faculty Advocate and the other comes from the humanities. The two Faculty Associates were onboarded in Spring 2024, with discussions of where they want to prioritize their work in the 2024-2025 academic year.

The ALLIES team also developed a set of policy and practice recommendations for BGSU's Colleges, vetted by the CIO. Colleges will soon be asked to revise their three-year Inclusion and Belonging Plans and our ALLIES recommendations will be sent to Colleges along with other materials to support that work.

In Year 6, we received requests from external groups interested in having us run allyship and inclusive leadership workshops. Members of the ALLIES team began working with BGSU's Vice President of Research and Office of Technology Transfer and Services to protect the intellectual property within these workshops so we can then continue to offer them beyond the end of the grant period. We have already been invited to conduct workshops at Case Western Reserve University and some of the U.S. National Laboratories in 2025.

Finally, throughout Year 6, we closely monitored the status of Ohio Senate Bill 83, which would prohibit state institutions from endorsing the concepts of allyship, diversity, systematic racism, gender identity, equity, or inclusion and ban any mandatory programs regarding diversity, equity, and inclusion. While the bill stalled out in the Ohio House in summer 2024, it may be revived in 2025, presenting new challenges to sustaining our work at BGSU.

b) Specific Objectives

Nothing to report

c) Significant Results

1) External Workshop Design and Feedback

The BGSU ALLIES team redesigned our allyship and inclusive leadership workshops for external audiences during Year 6. Details of those modifications and results of our workshops are provided in this section of the report.

The PI of the University of Toledo's ADVANCE project, Dr. Anju Gupta, arranged for us to facilitate a version of our faculty allyship workshop at the University of Toledo campus in December 2023. The workshop was slightly shortened (from 4 hours to 3.5 hours), and our scenarios for discussion were modified to align with the University of Toledo's academic structure. A total of 28 participants included faculty and faculty administrators from the University of Toledo, Lourdes University, Kettering University, and Wayne State University, and one senior woman engineer from a local materials engineering firm. Five members of the ALLIES team facilitated the workshop. The post-workshop evaluation survey was completed by 12 (43%) of the participants. All but one survey respondent indicated they were very satisfied or satisfied overall with the workshop. All respondents rated the workshop as very effective or effective in providing relevant ideas and strategies they can use and in promoting discussions relevant to the workshop objectives. All but one respondent noted they were very likely or likely to share what they had learned in the workshop with their colleagues. Participants identified the small group discussions, especially the scenario discussions in which they practiced the steps of bystander intervention, as especially valuable to them. They praised the facilitators and thought our acting out of microaggressions was a particular eye-opening strategy. One participant noted they would use our "privilege bead" activity with their own students.

An information technology engineer at the U.S. Pacific Northwest National Laboratory connected with members of the ALLIES team and invited us to run an inclusive leadership and allyship workshop at the National Laboratories Information Technology Summit in April 2024. To redesign our materials for this audience, we combined elements of our half-day faculty allyship workshop with components of our inclusive leadership program for faculty administrators, adding a new element called the "Inclusive Leadership Pathway", with an accompanying small-group discussion activity. We modified our case study scenarios for discussion to reflect a general STEM-focused workplace, rather than an academic setting. We also shortened our workshop to 2 hours to fit in the conference's scheduling block. A total of 24 participants representing six different national laboratories and the Department of Energy headquarters attended. Two members of the ALLIES team facilitated the workshop. We also held a 40-minute debriefing, Q&A, and discussion session the following day that four workshop participants attended. The post-workshop evaluation survey was completed by just 4 (17%) of participants. All respondents indicated they were very satisfied or satisfied overall with the workshop. All respondents rated the workshop as very effective or effective in providing relevant ideas and strategies they can use and in promoting discussions relevant to the workshop objectives. All respondents further noted they were very likely or likely to share what they had learned in the workshop with their colleagues. Participants identified the small-group discussion components of the workshop as especially valuable. They also appreciated the clear explanation of what privilege means and does not mean, the real-world examples, and the "guiding and empathetic tone" of the facilitators. When asked to identify the top inclusive leadership and allyship strategies they will take with them to implement in the future, respondents highlighted expanding their networks, connecting more and asking questions of their colleagues about their workplace experiences, noting the difference between intent and effect, and speaking up when needed. As one respondent put it, "...there are a ton of small individual scale things that I can do and will continue to do. I suppose the next level beyond that is to try to enlist [and] recruit other men to do similarly. If enough of us take on that role we can definitely change culture too." After the NLIT workshop, several participants and one non-participant who had heard how effective our workshop was all asked if we would be available to conduct similar workshops at individual national laboratories. The ALLIES team is now working to protect the intellectual property rights on our training materials and develop a structured program to continue offering these workshops to external audiences.

2) BGSU STEM and SBS Faculty and Chair/Director Demographics

To assess changes in BGSU's STEM and SBS faculty demographics over the course of the BGSU ALLIES project, we compiled and compared data from Fall 2018 (the start of ALLIES) to Fall 2024 (the end of ALLIES). These data are available in the appended project data file. As expected, the overall proportion of women faculty in STEM and SBS units – 44% – has not changed in the six years since the ALLIES project began (Tables 2 and 3). The faculty hiring process is slow and was also disrupted at BGSU by the COVID pandemic of 2020-2023. Our goal has therefore been to train faculty and faculty administrators in best practices to recognize and combat gender bias in faculty hiring, with the aim to increase the number of STEM women being hired and promoted at BGSU over at least a ten-year interval. One highlight of our demographic data is the increase in the proportion of pre-tenure women faculty, from 39% of tenure-track faculty in Fall 2018 to 48% in Fall 2024 (Tables 2 and 3). If these women are tenured in the next few years, that will help increase the proportion of tenured STEM women faculty at BGSU. To explore demographic data from an intersectional framework, we disaggregated faculty counts by gender, underrepresented minority (URM) status, and faculty rank. There have been no significant changes in the overall proportion of URM faculty from 2018 to 2024 (7% of all STEM and SBS faculty; Tables 4 and 5), but the number of URM women faculty in STEM and SBS fields dropped slightly from 8 to 6 people over that interval, while the number of URM men faculty increased from 11 to 12 (Table 6 and 7).

Finally, over the last six years, the BGSU ALLIES project has trained a significant percentage of current STEM and SBS faculty and Chairs/Directors in allyship and inclusive leadership strategies. Of the Fall 2024 STEM and SBS faculty cohort of 254 full-time faculty, 84 (33%) are alumni of our Faculty Allies program and another 6 faculty (3 STEM and 3 SBS) are ALLIES team members. The ALLIES project has also trained most current STEM/SBS department chairs and school directors. Twelve (75%) of the current STEM/SBS Chairs/Directors of our sixteen Main Campus target units have participated in at least one BGSU ALLIES professional development opportunity. This includes five (31%) STEM/SBS Chairs/Directors who are Faculty Allies alumni and seven (44%) additional STEM/SBS Chairs/Directors who have completed at least one of our Inclusive Leadership workshops. Given how influential Chairs/Directors are in shaping their academic unit's culture, this critical mass of faculty

leaders will help enhance the workplace experience for women STEM faculty for years to come.

d) Key outcomes or other achievements

We have completed 11 of our 12 online training modules on allyship and inclusive leadership, with the last one nearly completed as of August 31, 2024. These modules are currently available for use by any interested BGSU faculty member or group.

We have established a Faculty Associates program within the Division of Inclusion and Belonging, which provides a structure for sustaining our programming and spreading our policy and practices recommendations throughout the university.

We have initiated the process of protecting the intellectual property associated with our faculty allyship and inclusive leadership workshops and other training materials.

We have successfully modified our workshops for non-BGSU audiences, including other universities and Information Technology professionals at U.S. National Laboratories.

In Year 6, the ALLIES team revised and re-submitted a manuscript to *ADVANCE Journal*, which was accepted in December 2023 and published online in January 2024:

Ro, H.K., Broido, E.M., Campbell-Jacobs, B., Hanasono, L.K., Yacobucci, M.M., and Root, K.V. (2024). Development of a faculty transformative ally behavior scale. *ADVANCE Journal* 4(2): Article 6. doi: 10.5399/osu/ADVJRNL.4.2.6

PI Yacobucci presented a poster at the 2024 Equity in STEM Community Convening: Yacobucci, M.M. 2024. Sustaining equity efforts for the long term. Equity in STEM Community Convening, June 2-5, 2024, Baltimore, MD.

3. What opportunities for training and professional development has the project provided?

In Summer 2024, we hired one BGSU doctoral student, I. Stouffer (Higher Education) as a graduate assistant to collaborate on our Multi-Institutional Faculty Allyship (MIFA) research project.

4. Have the results been disseminated to communities of interest? If so, please provide details.

As detailed in other sections of this report, in Year 6, we presented aspects of the BGSU ALLIES project at the 2024 Equity in STEM Community Convening and published on development of our faculty allyship behavior scale in the ADVANCE Journal. We also conducted allyship and inclusive leadership workshops at the University of Toledo (with other local universities participating) and National Laboratories Information Technology Summit.

Accomplishments - Supporting Files:

[no additional files]

Products

Website description ["Websites or Other Internet Sites"]

Title: BGSU ALLIES: Advancing the role of women in academic STEM careers

URL: https://www.bgsu.edu/allies

Description:

BGSU ALLIES project website. Includes overview of project, directory of ALLIES team members, goals and objectives, project programs, web and downloadable resources, events calendar, and project news.

Uploaded files

File: BGSU-ALLIES_Project-Data ["Other Product"]

Description: Demographic data for BGSU faculty and Chairs/Directors Fall 2018 vs. Fall 2024

Paper/Presentations

File: Ro_et_al_2024_ADVANCE-Journal_Faculty_Allyship

Description: Paper describing our Faculty Transformative Ally Behavior Scale published in the ADVANCE

Journal

File: 2024 EiSCC BGSU-ALLIES Yacobucci

Description: Poster on our project sustainability efforts, presented at 2024 Equity in STEM Community

Convening

Participants/Organizations

1. What individuals have worked on the project?

For each person, they want:

- 1. Email address
- 2. Most Senior Project Role (from pull-down menu of choices)
- 3. Nearest Person Month Worked (1 person month = 160 hours of effort)
- 4. Contribution to the Project (see list below)
- 5. Funding Support = a list of any <u>other</u> funding support, other than the award, that supported the participant's participation in the project will be NONE for all but Kaoutar

PI/Co-PI Contributions to the Project

Yacobucci:

Responsible for overall project management, participant in Faculty Allies subteam

Hanasono:

Leader of Faculty Allies subteam

Broido, Root:

Member of Faculty Allies subteam

O'Neil, Peña, Roberts, Zickar:

Members of Inclusive Leadership subteam

Stouffer:

Project summer graduate assistant

2. What other organizations have been involved as partners?

CWRU, Cleveland, Ohio University of Toledo, Toledo, Ohio

Dr. Hyun Kyoung Ro, University of North Texas, Denton, Texas, hyunkyoung.ro@unt.edu

Details: Former BGSU ALLIES team member Dr. Hyun Kyoung Ro left BGSU to take a faculty position at the University of North Texas in August 2020. We continue to collaborate with Dr. Ro on ALLIES research projects.

3. What other collaborators or contacts have been involved? List any other people or organizations involved in the project that were not separately reported as participants or partner organizations.

Impact

What is the impact on the <u>development of the principal discipline(s)</u> of the project?

The BGSU ALLIES team developed and tested an evidence-based program that empowers faculty members and university leaders to actively advance gender equity, diversity, and inclusion by enacting allyship and inclusive leadership behaviors. Our program has helped influential faculty and leaders from our principal disciplines learn how to proactively communicate to prevent and respond to biases and discrimination. The individuals who completed our training can, in turn, apply their knowledge and skills in the classroom (i.e., serve as more effective, equitable, and inclusive teachers), their labs and research spaces (e.g., promoting allyship and inclusive leadership in their research teams), and day-to-day activities at the workplace.

In Year 6, we presented on our project sustainability strategy at the 2024 Equity in STEM Community Convening. We also published a paper in the ADVANCE Journal describing development of a faculty allyship behavior scale. The findings from these investigations have the potential to expand the body of social scientific scholarship on the antecedents and outcomes of faculty allyship.

2. What is the impact on other disciplines?

The techniques found to be effective with STEM faculty—understanding privilege, intersectionality, practicing ally behaviors, and being part of a supportive community of faculty allies—are hypothesized to be effective in related disciplines.

3. What is the impact on the <u>development of human resources</u>?

By equipping faculty and administrators with the knowledge and skills needed to enact allyship and inclusive leadership—and by changing or creating more equitable policies and practices—we anticipate that our program will improve the organizational climate of STEM units and lead to improved rates of retention and career advancement, especially among those who are women faculty and/or faculty of color in STEM and SBS disciplines. In addition, our training programs complement and extend the current collection of human resource training for those in science, engineering, and technology.

One PhD student, Ilana Stouffer in Higher Education & Student Affairs, served as a part-time student research assistant for the BGSU ALLIES project in Summer 2024. Through their participation in ALLIES, she has gained experience in doing social science research (e.g., scale development, cognitive interviewing), skills she will bring with her when she completes her doctoral dissertation and moves into an academic faculty and/or professional position.

4. What was the impact on teaching and educational experiences?

Many of our Faculty Allies report that they have translated their ally training into their teaching and mentoring work with undergraduate and graduate students, creating more inclusive climates and pedagogies.

5. What is the impact on physical resources that form infrastructure?

Nothing to report

6. What is the impact on <u>institutional resources that form infrastructure</u>?

Nothing to report

7. What is the impact on information resources that form infrastructure?

Nothing to report

8. What is the impact on technology transfer?

Nothing to report

9. What is the impact on society beyond science and technology?

Many faculty participants have discussed the transferability of ally concepts to their teaching and the potential impact that creating classrooms with greater respect for gender equity and other marginalized groups would have as their students graduate and influence society at large.

Our research results may inform other organizations (e.g., government agencies, non-profit organizations, for-profit companies) seeking to implement allyship and inclusive leadership training for their employees.

10. What percentage of the award's budget was spent in a foreign country?

Nothing to report

Changes/Problems

1. Changes in approach and reasons for change

Nothing to report

2. Actual or Anticipated problems or delays and actions or plans to resolve them

One obstacle to evaluating the impact of the BGSU ALLIES project has been gaining access to the 2023 COACHE survey data. While we have summary data from previous iterations of the COACHE survey, BGSU's Office of the Provost has declined to share data from the 2023 survey with us. We had intended to compare COACHE data from prior to the BGSU ALLIES project (2015), the first year of our project (2019), and year 5 of our project (2023) to assess the impact of our work on faculty satisfaction, particularly of women in STEM departments. At this stage, access to the 2023 data seems unlikely.

Another source of concern has been Ohio Senate Bill 83. This legislation would prohibit state institutions from "endorsing" the concepts of allyship, diversity, systematic racism, gender identity, equity, or inclusion, ban any mandatory programs regarding diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI), and prohibit any training (mandatory or not) that "advocates or promotes" the concept of unconscious bias. This bill specifically targets topics that are core components of the BGSU ALLIES programming, including our online modules, such as allyship, equity, inclusion, and unconscious bias. Similar legislation that has been signed into law in other states has had a chilling effect, prompting closures of DEI-focused offices, the halting of DEI-related programs and trainings, and the exodus of DEI professionals from state universities. While S.B. 83 stalled out in 2024, it seems clear from national trends that evidence-based programs to support diverse faculty will continue to be subject to legislative threats.

Despite these challenges, the BGSU ALLIES team has been moving forward with our sustainability plan in partnership with the Division of Inclusion and Belonging and with the support of the President's Office. Our team believes we can continue our work to institutionalize our programs and leverage our Faculty Allies and Advocates, Inclusive Leaders, and new Inclusion and Belonging Faculty Associates to transform the institution. BGSU ALLIES' ultimate goal is to make allyship and inclusive leadership the norm and

expectation at BGSU; we will continue our efforts to ensure the BGSU community has the tools to take collective responsibility for shaping a more inclusive university.

3. Changes that have significant impact on expenditures

Nothing to report

4. Significant changes in use or care of human subjects

Nothing to report

5. Significant changes in use or care of vertebrate animals

Nothing to report

6. Significant changes in use or care of biohazards

Nothing to report

7. Has there been a change in your primary performance site location from the originally proposed? If so, please provide the location of your new primary performance site and reason for the change in location.

Nothing to report

Special Requirements

Nothing to report