

**DOCTOR OF MUSICAL ARTS
BOWLING GREEN STATE UNIVERSITY**

Response to RACGS Reviews of Full Proposal
March 25, 2005

Our thanks to those colleagues who responded to the proposal for a Doctor of Musical Arts in the field of Contemporary Music with a specialization in composition or performance. Your comments have given us an opportunity to address concerns, thereby strengthening our proposal. Your positive support has allowed us to go forward with an innovative and timely degree that will be a distinctive addition to graduate education in the state of Ohio.

We received 17 responses from 12 institutions during the two phases of the review process (2002-04). Akron, Case Western, Cleveland State, Dayton, Kent State, Ohio, Toledo, Wright State, and Youngstown State were very positive; Miami was positive, but asked for some clarification on the second level. The strongest concerns came from Cincinnati and Ohio State.

We would like to begin with a summary of positive comments and then will address those concerns that remain.

Summary of Positive Comments

10 of 12 institutions support the proposal. There is uniform agreement that BGSU has an outstanding reputation in contemporary music and has the ability to offer such a degree. It is well positioned with key faculty, excellent facilities, and the MidAmerican Center for Contemporary Music. Reviewers feel that the proposal is strong and the academics appropriate. Many see this proposal as unique, forward looking, and innovative. 11 institutions perceive no duplication with other degree programs in Ohio.

Reviews from Youngstown recognize that “the Bowling Green State University College of Musical Arts has developed a strong commitment to contemporary music and a positive reputation for the program has followed. . . . a very strong proposal. The requirements for the degree are of high academic quality and appropriate for the doctoral level.” “BGSU has for years now led the region and sustained a respected national profile in Contemporary music studies and composition with Festivals, Guest Artists, faculty resources and archival materials. . . .” This is echoed in reviews from Cleveland State: “Bowling Green State University has a strong reputation for its programs in composition and in the performance of new music. Its faculty is well known, and has among its members composers and performers who have won many awards and attained wide recognition for having made significant contributions to contemporary music. . . . a logical place for such a doctoral program in Ohio.” Wright State observes: “The musical program at BGSU has a reputation for excellence, has a substantial student body, and currently offers a variety of degrees at the bachelors and masters level. For an institution of this type, a doctoral degree would seem appropriate to me.” Kent State adds that “Bowling Green has a long tradition of excellence in music and seems appropriately positioned to offer this degree program focused on Contemporary Music.” Akron supports the proposal and states that the degree “seems to be well-placed within the strengths of the College

Doctor of Musical Arts – Response Document

Bowling Green State University

Page 2

of Musical Arts at Bowling Green.” Cincinnati confirms that “there is no question that Bowling Green State University has the interest and support for contemporary music.”

Miami’s review recognizes the unique nature of the degree, as well as the strength of the proposal: “The proposal is thorough in scope and addresses all the important facets of a new program (curriculum, staffing, facilities, budget, need, etc.). The focus of the degree is indeed unique in Ohio and beyond, and includes a curriculum that allows for an appropriate flexibility in the area of contemporary music with regard to specialization (composition, performance, research).” The University of Toledo adds that “the program will be a great musical resource for the region. . . . and seems to both reflect and meet the rapidly changing needs of music in the 21st Century.” Colleagues at Dayton state that “the DMA would seem to fill a niche and the University should be commended for proposing a new and interesting alternative.”

Cleveland confirms the adequacy of facilities: “The proposal lists very clearly the computational resources, library, recording studios, practice and rehearsal facilities, resource centers for popular and serious music, and equipment necessary for the program. The facilities are state of the art and more than adequate to sustain the degree program.”

Addressing Concerns and Suggestions

Most concerns from the original reviews of the Program Development Plan were adequately addressed when the full proposal was presented. However, we appreciate the comments of our colleagues upon review of the full proposal and find that the concerns cluster around the following: international students; course load for faculty; 4-year length of degree program; remedial work and depth of study in music history, music theory, and research methodology; limited focus; and need and perceived duplication.

1. International students: assistantships, TOEFL requirement, and provisions for English language study.

Our colleagues at Ohio State had questions about international students, more specifically assistantship opportunities, TOEFL requirements (given a traditionally high concentration of Asian students in the field of music), and provisions for English language study. The College of Musical Arts is proud of the rich heritage international students bring to our program. Of the 121 master’s students registered in Fall 2004, 19 were international students representing 11 countries: Belarus, Canada, Ghana, Greece, Korea, Malaysia, the Philippines, Romania, Russia, Taiwan, and Venezuela. 15 of these students held assistantships. As has been our practice for master’s study, any international student will be eligible for available assistantships on the doctoral level.

All candidates for graduate degrees in the College of Musical Arts must meet the required standards of the BGSU Graduate College. The TOEFL requirement as stated in the Graduate Handbook is 550. Ohio State also requires 550, while Cincinnati requires 525. For students who demonstrate need, the university has a comprehensive ESL program for those who are not fluent in English.

Doctor of Musical Arts – Response Document

Bowling Green State University

Page 3

2. Course load for faculty.

Ohio State was concerned with faculty course load and observed that no additional faculty had been requested as part of the proposal. We designed the program to be small and focused; no more than 4 new doctoral students representing the disciplines of composition, conducting, and performance will be admitted in any given year. Because BGSU has enjoyed more than adequate and highly selective enrollment in its music degree programs (currently 393 undergraduate and 121 graduate students), we have a carefully structured load management system in place and have considered the impact of adding a doctoral program.

It is presumed that doctoral students will come to study with a particular faculty mentor and will assist said mentor with teaching duties. For example, a doctoral student in orchestral conducting may as part of her/his assistantship teach the undergraduate conducting course, which is normally part of the load of Dr. Emily Freeman Brown. The doctoral assistant may also be responsible for some rehearsals of the BG Philharmonia. A doctoral assistant in the saxophone studio of Dr. John Sampen could coach ensembles and teach undergraduate majors. In principle, faculty will have a workload adjustment commensurate with engagement in the doctoral program.

Doctoral students, unlike master's students, will be able to teach specific undergraduate courses and selected master's courses, potentially one course a semester. This practice is in keeping with the majority of doctoral music programs nationwide. Courses offered at BGSU that could be taught by doctoral students include the following: basic musicianship, music theory, aural skills, class piano, instrumental and vocal methods, conducting, introduction to composition, orchestration, band scoring, choral arranging, new music ensemble, survey of music technology, music technology I and II, university band, studio instruction in composition and performance, ensembles, and graduate theory and history review. Our total cohort of 16 fulltime doctoral students would each carry a half-time assistantship, the equivalent of adding 8 new faculty.

Contrary to the observation of Ohio State, we have requested an additional fulltime faculty position, a specialist in late contemporary music history (post 1945). (See full proposal, p. 15.) This request will be addressed through a redistribution of resources as retirements occur.

3. 4-year length of program.

The University of Miami asked for more explanation about the proposed 4-year length of the degree program. Based on our experience with other institutions offering the doctorate in music, 4 years is a typical length of time to complete the degree. This, of course, can vary in either direction. Because we have designed the curriculum with the necessary flexibility to accommodate a variety of scenarios and that the 4th year is primarily non-classroom work, it is possible to complete the degree in less time and we would certainly support students who do so.

Doctor of Musical Arts – Response Document

Bowling Green State University

Page 4

The Graduate College at BGSU guarantees 4 years of funding for doctoral students, pending satisfactory progress toward the degree, and thus we are in alignment with the university norm. This may, in fact, appeal to students, who will welcome the opportunity to have funding for 4 years. Because our program is small in size, we believe that effective mentoring and 4-year guaranteed funding may in fact result in a shorter time to degree completion.

4. Remedial work and depth of study in the traditional areas of music history, music theory, and research methodology.

Cincinnati and Miami asked for more clarification with regard to remedial work and depth of study in music history, music theory, and research methodology, and we are happy to address their questions. Although the main research focus of the Doctor of Musical Arts is contemporary music, we recognize that study in any discipline must build on a firm foundation. Careful screening will keep admissions highly selective, so that only those students who are adequately prepared will be admitted to the program.

Applicants' general knowledge in music history (all style periods), music theory, and research methodology will be carefully assessed prior to acceptance. Those applicants who are invited to audition must take entrance exams in these areas at the time of the audition. Any necessary remedial work will be added to the applicant's degree program and will not be counted in the required 66 hours. If an accepted student demonstrates this need, we have appropriate courses. With regard to depth, the college offers a wide range of graduate level seminars in music history and music theory, as well as several courses in research methodology, and the student may take these as part of the curriculum. (See Appendix 2 in full proposal for a list of courses.)

Applicants in conducting and instrumental/vocal performance must submit a tape of performances from different style periods. Recital programs and documentation of performance activity of the past 5 years, as well as a complete repertoire list, are also required. This is one way of assessing readiness with regard to style periods. All applicants must also submit a sample original research paper.

Preliminary examinations (written and oral) are taken after completing 40 hours of course work. These examinations test the student's knowledge in music history and music theory, with particular emphasis on contemporary music. The examinations will also cover the student's area of specialization, composition or performance. While the primary emphasis is on contemporary music, the student must have a strong foundation in the music of previous eras.

We embrace the doctoral standards in history and theory that our accrediting institution, the National Association of Schools of Music, sets forth for any area of specialization: "a knowledge of the techniques of music theory sufficient to perform advanced analysis; a knowledge of the representative literature and composers of each major period of music history; a knowledge of general bibliographic resources in music; considerable depth of

Doctor of Musical Arts – Response Document

Bowling Green State University

Page 5

knowledge in some aspect of music, such as an historical period, an aspect of theory, performance practice, or compositional styles.” (NASM 2003-04 Handbook, p. 110)

Finally, Miami presents the dilemma that faces any new program—some may see the departure from the traditional path of study as a weakness, while others see it as a strength and an opportunity for new contextual inquiry.

5. Limited focus of degree program.

Our colleagues at Cincinnati acknowledge that BGSU “has the interest and support for contemporary music,” but question the limited focus of such a degree. Others, however, see this as a logical and timely direction (Cleveland, Dayton, Kent, Miami, Toledo, Youngstown). We will attempt to address the concerns voiced by Cincinnati.

Doctoral degrees are by nature limited. Just as there are corollaries in other fields (e.g., Photochemistry at BGSU; Oral Biology or Geodetic Science and Surveying at Ohio State; and Manufacturing Management at Toledo), contemporary music is a research niche that is important in the discipline of music and one that can be supported by the resources in place at BGSU. Built on the historic and theoretical knowledge that is already part of traditional music studies, the research focus of this degree is contemporary music. Doctoral study presumes a readiness that strong undergraduate and master’s programs should address. With thorough screening and assessment, we will accept only those students at the doctoral level who have demonstrated an appropriate grounding in the traditional practices of music. It is not our intention to begin traditional music training at the doctoral level.

Are there other doctoral degrees in music that are specialized? Our colleagues at Case Western offer a highly respected doctorate in Early Music, as does Indiana University. The Doctor of Musical Arts in Contemporary Music Performance is offered at the University of California, San Diego, and serves as a model for the design of the BGSU degree. In the past two years, new graduate niche programs have been inaugurated at Brown University (Electronic Music and Multimedia), the University of Virginia (Composition and Computer Technology), and the University of Washington (Digital Arts and Experimental Media). (Please see Appendix I for a more comprehensive listing of new degree programs.) To offer a doctoral degree in music that combines the study of contemporary music with cognates in culture, cognition, and digital media places BGSU and the state of Ohio in the forefront of the profession. This new degree will prepare a different kind of musician—linked to society, entrepreneurial, engaged.

In designing a niche program, one builds on strengths. The College of Musical Arts has both the faculty and the facilities to support this proposal. Many of the faculty have national and international reputations in contemporary music, culture and/or pedagogical studies (composition—Beerman, Kuehn, Lillios, Shrude), (conducting—Freeman Brown, Moss), (performance—Sampen, Schempf, Schupp, Okerlund, Mathis, Satterlee, Melton, Smith, Assimakopoulos, Rodgers), (music theory—Broman), (musicology/culture—Hess, Natvig, Cornelius, Harnish) and (music education/cognition—Gromko, Kennell). Given this cohort of faculty (as well as numerous others in the college and university), BGSU is well positioned to

Doctor of Musical Arts – Response Document

Bowling Green State University

Page 6

offer this degree. In addition, our facilities and special resources (MidAmerican Center for Contemporary Music, Popular Culture Library and Sound Recording Archives, Music Technology and Recording Studios, Digital Media Center, Wolfe Center for the Performing Arts), as well as the 2003 Academic Plan, show that the university has made a commitment to the contemporary arts.

6. Need for degree and perceived duplication.

The review from Youngstown captures the spirit of the majority of our respondents when addressing need: “The program proposal developed by BGSU proves a need for this degree. The idea of offering three focus areas, one in composition, one in conducting, and one in performance makes this a very strong proposal. It is difficult to predict where music will go, but I feel the program proposal developed by the Bowling Green State University College of Musical Arts will help to prepare musicians for success in shaping the future of music.” Miami recognizes the new direction of such a degree and the alternatives it might provide: “The terminal projects (musical compositions, performances, research papers, and portfolio) are entirely appropriate for this degree and offer a viable option to the traditional dissertation in Doctor of Philosophy degree programs. Bowling Green’s interest in the area of contemporary music, and the success of its MidAmerican Center for Contemporary Music, are important factors to consider. They provide a strong foundation upon which a new program can successfully be built.” Cleveland State notes the uniqueness and the possibility of collaboration: “While there are other doctoral programs in composition available at state institutions (OSU, KSU), none has the distinct focus of the proposed DMA in Contemporary Music from Bowling Green. Bowling Green is in an accessible location and provides opportunity for inter-institutional collaboration.”

Strongest concerns were voiced from two of the four institutions that offer doctorates in music (Cincinnati and Ohio State). While Cincinnati’s concerns cluster around general knowledge and limited focus (already addressed in #s 4 and 5), they also speak about lack of job opportunities (“I do not know of any faculty positions where such a limited focus would be an attraction for any openings”) and the employability of our graduates (“I cannot envision employing a graduate of the Bowling Green State University program at the University of Cincinnati College-Conservatory of Music or similar colleges across the nation”). We respectfully offer Appendix II which lists job opportunities in music over the past two years that specifically ask for the kind of expertise such a degree would offer (technology, 20th century focus, enthusiasm for contemporary music, new music performance, digital arts, American music, composition, cross boundaries, etc.). These position announcements may serve as examples of job opportunities for future graduates of the proposed program.

The concerns of Ohio State focus on redundancy (“...what is the benefit to the State of Ohio that is not currently being met at other state institutions?”), potential applicants (“Is there indeed a pool of applicants waiting for such a degree?”), and regional competition (“Regional competition for excellent students will be fierce with BGSU flanked by University of Michigan to the west, with Cleveland Institute of Music and Case Western Reserve University to the east...”).

Doctor of Musical Arts – Response Document

Bowling Green State University

Page 7

With regard to redundancy, 11 of 13 respondents said that there would be no duplication in the state. Cleveland states, “This program is distinctly different both conceptually and qualitatively from not only BGSU’s undergraduate programs but from every other doctoral program in the state of Ohio. The multidisciplinary concentration in contemporary music involves not only composition, as is traditional, but also performance, conducting, music history, significant technology training and advanced studies in theory.”

We believe that there will be a rich and viable applicant pool given our plan to admit only 4 new students a year across the disciplines of both composition and performance with a total cohort of not more than 16. Our own master’s program, one of the largest in the nation with 121 students registered in Fall 2004, will undoubtedly serve as one source of students. In fact, we receive several inquiries per week with regard to our offering a doctoral degree. Furthermore, keeping the best and brightest students in Ohio can only add to its quality of life.

Finally, we do not see ourselves competing with any of the institutions in Ohio. Our program is distinctly different. The following comments from our reviewers substantiate this: “Will the matriculation of 16 new students at Bowling Green actually hurt OSU’s graduate program? Probably not.” (OSU); “I am not aware of any potential conflicts between the proposed DMA program and any others. The proposed DMA is in the field of Contemporary Music; our own DMA is in Early Music and the DMA at The Cleveland Institute of Music (which utilizes CWRU music faculty extensively) is quite broad—some DMA students at CIM choose to emphasize contemporary music but there is not a formalized contemporary music program of the sort being proposed by BGSU. I have talked with the dean at CIM and he sees no potential conflict.” (CWRU 2003); “. . . a D.M.A in Contemporary Music would be a unique offering, while one with concentrations in composition or performance would not, since they are already offered at several institutions within the State of Ohio.” (Kent 2003). Regional competition already exists at the master’s level, and the program at BGSU is meeting that competition successfully.

Conclusion

We see the future of music as exciting and challenging, with new programs and job opportunities that call for the expertise a multidisciplinary program of studies would support. Our hope is to be an active participant in the future direction of the profession, rather than a recipient of what is or will be inevitable. The College of Musical Arts has many of the resources in place, as well as a proven track record of over 25 years of outstanding and well-respected work in contemporary music. We have a thriving and forward-looking music program, and this will help secure our position among those institutions that offer the highest degree in the music discipline. It is an important and critical step for BGSU and the College of Musical Arts, as well as the state of Ohio.

**APPENDIX I
NEW DEGREE PROGRAMS OF A NON-TRADITIONAL NATURE**

<u>Place</u>	<u>School</u>	<u>Degree</u>	<u>Specialization</u>	<u>Unique attributes</u>	<u>Outside experience</u>
USA					
CA	UC Santa Cruz	DMA	Composition w/tracks in computer-assst comp and world mus comp	Ensemble, festival	
DC	Catholic U	MM	Composition w/stage mus emph	Performance opportunities	externship in DC
FL	U of FL	MM, PhD	Acoustic and/or EA comp	Annual EA Fest, ensemble	
GA	Georgia Southern U	MM	Music Technology	Flexible	
MD	UM-Baltimore	Certificate	American Contemp Mus	Ensemble	
NY	Syracuse U	MM	Pan African Studies	Multidisciplinary	external exp
RI	Brown	PhD	Electronic music and multimedia	Interdisciplinary; collab w/RISD	
VA	U VA	PhD	Composition & Computer tech	Center	
WA	U Wash	PhD	Digital Arts and Experimental Media	Draws from all arts and sciences	
<u>NON-USA</u>					
Australia	Macquarie U	BA, MA, PhD	20/21st C music	Publications, recording	
Finland	U of Jyvaskyla	MM	Mind and Technology	Studio, technology	
Germany	Doncaster College	MA	Digital Performance	Facilities, guest artists	
UK	City U, London	MA - self designed	Arts Management	London	Work in field
UK	Sheffield U	MA in Cont Mus Studies, MM Comp, PhD Comp	Acousmatic, perf EA, AV works, software tools, EA musicology and aesthetics	Facilities, performances	
UK	Goldsmiths Coll	MM	Studio comp/aud technology		

**APPENDIX II
JOBS WITH EXPERTISE GAINED IN BGSU DOCTORAL PROGRAM**

<u>Date posted</u>	<u>Position</u>	<u>Field</u>	<u>Place</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>Qualifications</u>
3/14/2005	Asst Prof	Piano	Waldorf College	IA	Doct; all aspects of piano and music tech
3/1/2005	Lecturer	Composition	City University, London	UK	Electroacoustic, or composer-performer; excellent research record
3/1/2005	Lecturer	Music genres, music practice or applied music	City University, London	UK	Combine theory and practice; culture since 1945; excellent research record
2/28/2005	Asst Prof	New Media/Hist R&R	St. Cloud State U	MN	Doct; elec mus, new media, collab
2/25/2005	Asst Prof	Violin	SUNY Purchase	NY	Doct; studio vln and passion for contemp mus
2/25/2005	Asst Prof	Composition	Suny Purchase	NY	Doct; comp; also hist post 1945 or world music
2/15/2005	Instr/asst prof	Woodwinds	Millersville U	PA	Doct; also mus bus or tech
2/11/2005	Asst Prof	World mus, th, appr	Palomar College	CA	Also interdis curric
2/1/2005	Asst Prof	Mus Tech, comp	College of NJ	NJ	Doct, tech
2/1/2005	Asst Prof	Entertain, mus bus	Belmont U	TN	Doct, industry
1/28/2005	2 Lectureships	Multimedia Research	Sonic Arts Research Center	Belfast, No. Ireland	Degree in Mus or Mus Tech
1/5/2005	Asst Prof	Mus tech, industry	Chowan College	NC	PhD, mus bus, brass
10/25/2004	Asst or Assoc	Musicology	Tufts U	Mass	PhD w/expertise in 20th
10/6/2004	Asst Prof	Voice	SUNY Buffalo	NY	Demonstrated commit to and enthusiasm for contemporary music
10/8/2004	Mus Tech	Tech support	U of Manchester	England	Bckgrd in mus tech +
10/10/2004	Mus Tech	Tech support	U of Aberdeen	Scotland	Degree in Mus or Mus Tech

10/13/2004	Asst Prof	Flute	U Maryland Baltimore	Maryland	Specialization in new music
12/22/2004	Asst Prof	Elec Mus	Northeastern U	MA	Doctorate; bckgrd tech
11/10/2004	Asst Prof	Composition	U of Virginia	VA	DMA; contribute to prog in comp and computing tech (film, multimedia, etc.)
11/23/2004	Asst Prof	Composition	U of Pittsburgh	PA	All & new music perf, present, EA
12/1/2004	Asst or Assoc	Theory/comp	U of Miami	FL	All
10/28/2004	Asst Prof	Mus Tech, comp, th	Cal State Hayward	CA	Mus Tech, comp, th
12/1/2003	Asst Prof	Pop music	Colorado College	CO	Interdis training soc, culture stud,
12/1/2003	Asst Prof	Folklore/ethno	Indiana U	IN	Spec in public art, cult
11/30/2003	Dept head	Mus Industry	Musictech College	MN	Mus ind, rec, pub,
11/30/2003	Instructor	Mus Business	Musictech College	MN	Mus Bus
11/1/2003	Asst Prof	theory	Rhodes College	TN	Mus tech lab
10/29/2003	Asst pro	Digital arts	U Wash	WA	Digital arts
10/29/2003	Lecturer	Digital arts	U Wash	WA	Digital arts
10/26/2003		Musicology	Middle TN	TN	Amer mus
10/17/2003	Visiting lect	Various	Tufts	MA	Interdis, contemp issues
10/15/2003	Asst prof	Broad mus, interdis	Stena College	NY	Doc
10/12/2003	Asst Prof	th, contemp hist, comp	IU South Bend	IN	PhD
10/12/2003	Dir, teacher	Women and Gender	Ohio Wesleyan	OH	Bck cross-cult issues; PhD spec open
10/12/2003	Asst prof	Amer Stud	U of Virginia	VA	Can be in music; build prog, cross boundaries
10/12/2003	Orch Dir	Orch, etc.	Eastern AZ College	AZ	Multiple abilities
10/12/2003	Instr	music	Bainbridge College	GA	Multiple abilities
10/12/2003	Asst Prof	Violin	U of NM	NM	Latin Am music
10/10/2003	Lect	Mus Tech	U of Hertfordshire	UK	Mus tech, comp, perf ability
10/10/2003	Instr	Dig Med Prod	Ursinus College	PA	PhD; one area com tech
10/1/2003	Asst Prof	Musicology	U of Kansas	KS	US, Latin Am scholar who performs

9/26/2003	Asst Prof	piano, hist	Monmouth College	IL	Term; role of mus in lib arts campus
9/24/2003	Any rank	Comp mus; multimed	Brown	RI	Devel interdis curric
9/12/2003	Asst Prof	Latin Am Studies	San Fran State	CA	PhD in any interdis field in humanities
9/5/2003	Instructor	Dir of Prep Div	Temple	PA	PhD pref; address changing needs
9/5/2003	Asst Prof	Mus Theory	U Texas, Austin	TX	Post-1945 or pop
9/2/2003	Asst or assoc	Musicology	Eastman	NY	WAM since 1800/Amer/crit